

## THE MARKET FOR MIGRANT DOMESTIC AND SEX WORKERS: RESEARCH REPORT

### Background

In the spring of 2001, we were commissioned by the Swedish Ministry for Foreign Affairs to lead a multi-country pilot study of the demand for migrant domestic and sex workers and its connections to the phenomenon of trafficking in four countries (Sweden, Italy, Thailand and India). This study was to be undertaken between September 2001 and April 2002, and allowed little time for data analysis. We therefore sought funding from the ESRC to extend and develop this pilot work through matching and supplementary research in the UK and Spain, and more rigorous and detailed analysis of the data generated by the pilot study and the follow-on research.

Trafficking was emerging as a major policy preoccupation at both national and international levels, and was largely understood in the context of organised immigration crime and sexual exploitation. Many commentators conflated 'trafficking' with prostitution, treated demand for prostitution as a 'root cause' of trafficking and argued that demand should therefore be criminalized. We felt this analysis was overly simplistic. It overlooked the many definitional difficulties associated with the term 'trafficking', deflected attention from similar problems in other sectors, including domestic work, and ignored the exploitation and abuse of migrants entering countries through perfectly legal channels. Furthermore, assumptions about the demand for commercial sex were rarely based in evidence on the attitudes or practices of sex workers' clients, nor were parallels between buying sex and paying to consume other services (such as those provided by domestic workers) considered in relation to policies designed to suppress demand.

The assumption that there was a specific demand for *trafficked* prostitutes obscured broader questions about the existence of demand for cheap and unprotected labour in a number of sectors, including but not limited to the sex sector, and so obscured questions about the role of the state in constructing these markets. Our aim in the pilot study and follow on research was to gather empirical data that could better inform policy on the demand for migrant sex and domestic workers in general, and its relation to trafficking in particular. We also sought to generate data that would allow us to engage with theoretical debates around migration; forced and free labour; embodied and emotional labour; gender, race, sexuality, nationality and citizenship (Morris, 2006; Wolkowitz, 2002; Yuval Davis, 1997; Schuster, 2003; Einhorn, 2004; Ungerson, 2003; Nichols, 1980; Castles and Miller 1998).

NB. All references are listed in Appendix 2.

### Objectives

1. Complete, compare and analyse a standard set of quantitative and qualitative data on the demand for migrant sex workers and domestic workers in six countries.

We successfully gathered quantitative and qualitative data in six countries (see Appendix 1), but for reasons explained below, we were unable to fully standardise this data.

2. Gather empirical data on the ways in which the markets for migrant sex and domestic work articulate with other legal and illegal markets.

The research has generated extensive empirical data on the intersections of the markets for migrant sex and domestic workers and a) the market for those services

more generally; b) the market for trafficked persons; and c) tourism – see Results below.

3. Gather data on how clients/employers and third parties view the involvement of persons under the age of 18 in the sex trade and domestic work in order to assess the extent to which they are influenced by recent national and international measures to combat child sexual exploitation and child labour.

Through surveys and in-depth qualitative interviews, we have explored clients/employers and third parties attitudes towards children's involvement in domestic work and the sex trade – see Results.

4. Explore continuities and discontinuities between domestic work and sex work, paying particular attention to the role of the social/cultural imagination in constructing a market for migrant workers and questions about how this demand relates to broader socially tolerated attitudes towards race, gender, age and sexuality.

This objective has been met, see Results.

5. Make a significant contribution to current theorizing on gender, nationality, global interdependence, age, racial/ethnic identities and the complex intersections among these systems.

The data and analysis has allowed Anderson (2006) to produce a significantly revised and updated version of her 2000 book, *Doing the Dirty Work*, and thereby contribute to international debate and theory on these issues. It has helped O'Connell Davidson (2005) to make a significant contribution to theorizing on age and gender, nationality, global interdependence, racial/ethnic identities in relation to children's participation in the sex trade. The award holders have also contributed to theorizing in a number of journal articles and book chapters, and intend to further contribute to debates on these topics through works exploring continuities and discontinuities between sex and domestic work.

6. Develop comparative quantitative and qualitative methods for use in further research on prostitution, domestic work and trafficking.

In the original multi-country study, we piloted a number of different methods, and learned much about the methodological challenges presented by cross national research on prostitution, domestic work and trafficking, as well as about working with NGOs (important players in research on trafficking). Save the Children Sweden has published a detailed evaluation of the pilot study's methodology, lessons learned and recommendations for future research on these topics (Anderson and O'Connell Davidson, 2002). Anderson has since advised the New Opportunities Fund on academic/NGO collaboration, and conducted training workshops for postgraduates on researching migration. Reflections on ethical issues associated with the research have also been fed into a recent ESRC consultation on informed consent.

7. Facilitate evidence-based policy making in the areas of female migration, trafficking, sex work and domestic work.

We have achieved this objective – see sections on Activities, Outputs and Impacts.

## Methods

The pilot study was designed to explore attitudes towards, and experience of, the markets for migrant domestic and sex workers in four countries through a combination of the following methods: a survey of a sample of employers of domestic workers and a survey of a sample of 50 men from a group known to be especially likely to pay for commercial sexual services; depth interviews with a non-random sample of ten men who had paid for sex with migrant prostitutes, ten employers of migrant domestic workers and between five and ten third party beneficiaries of migrant prostitution or domestic work. The interviews were structured around a standard set of topics, and examined respondents' attitudes towards gender, race/ethnicity, age, and domestic work/commercial sex. The pilot study further sought identical attitudinal data from a matched control sample of ten people in each country who did not use prostitutes or employ domestic workers. The follow-on study was designed to gather identical data in the UK (London) and Spain (Barcelona), but further included: i) interviews with representatives from a range of organisations in each country (police, social services, immigration officials, migrant workers' organisations, women's organisations and NGOs involved in outreach work with prostitutes, STD clinics), with a view to gathering background information that would allow us to contextualise data from our depth interviews; and ii) ethnographic and survey research in Tenerife, where it would be possible to explore possible intersections between tourism and the markets for migrant sex and domestic workers, and more particularly to investigate Spanish and British tourists' experience of, and attitudes towards, the burgeoning tourist-related sex industry on the island.

Problems that arose during the course of the pilot study (described in 6. Major difficulties) meant that our country teams were unable to target an identical group of men for the commercial sex survey in each country. We have ensured that the follow on research produced standard data sets for Spain and the UK, but these data cannot be compared with all of the sex survey data from the pilot study. For reasons set out in Appendix 1, the data set generated by the pilot study also differed from the data set we had initially planned in other respects.

Some additional data was also gathered during the follow on research. The applicants were invited to speak at conferences in Bangkok and Hong Kong, and took the opportunity to collect matching data from a sample of expatriate Britons living in these cities at no additional cost to the project. These data have proved extremely valuable in terms of controlling for the impact of the wider social and legal context in which employment relations are forged. Also, in 2003, the Poppy Project (a London-based NGO that provides services for trafficked women) published research that had attempted to map the market for migrant sex workers in London through a telephone survey of indoor prostitution establishments and escort agencies. The widely cited report presented evidence on the presence of migrants in the sex sector as if it were evidence on the use of trafficked labour in that sector. We noted a number of methodological problems with the design of the research, and given its close overlap with the concerns of our own research, we felt that it would be useful to replicate the Poppy survey, but include questions that they had omitted to ask. We therefore conducted a telephone survey of 148 establishments that sold sex in London, and it produced extremely interesting findings.

The data set generated by the pilot study and the follow on research using the methods outlined above is provided in Appendix 1. Quantitative data was analysed using SPSS. Qualitative data was analysed using a combination of methods, including Nvivo 7.

## Results

### ***The Social and Cultural Construction of Demand***

Analysis of the data from the pilot study underlined the fact that consumer demand for commercial sex and for domestic workers in private households, like consumer demand for other products or services, is very much a socially, culturally and historically determined matter (Anderson and O'Connell Davidson, 2002, 2003). It also showed that demand is intimately related to questions about supply, in the sense of availability and affordability, and this was confirmed by our research in London and Barcelona, as well as by our interviews with expatriate British employers in Thailand and Hong Kong, and by our research on demand for commercial sex in Tenerife. Our data show there is no absolute or given level of demand for the services of sex or domestic workers, and where they are cheaply available, people are more likely to 'need' them. Expatriate British employers who had managed with a weekly cleaner in the UK, found that they 'needed' to employ two live-in domestic workers in a similar sized house in Bangkok. One interviewee stated that when she had lived in Indonesia, where domestic workers were paid even less than in Thailand, she had employed eight domestic workers. Similarly, client interviewees identified the visibility and affordability of commercial sexual services as a factor influencing their decisions to buy sex.

However, though supply and affordability was a necessary condition for demand, it was not a sufficient condition. Demand was also linked to our interviewees' and respondents' personal histories and circumstances, and in the case of sexual services, often to a sequence of chance events. With domestic work, the decision to start employing was more usually related to a change in circumstances, such as getting married, having a baby, or moving abroad. Interviewees had typically come from families that had employed domestic workers during their own childhoods, and had been socialised to accept this as a norm (two of our Spanish interviewees were 'given' live-in domestic workers by their mothers when they married).

Demand for these services was also socially constructed in other senses. Though the management of home and family life, as well as of the self as a sexual being, are widely imagined as private matters, social norms played an important role in guiding the behaviour of our interviewees. Tourists in Tenerife described buying sexual services as part of the 'life-style' that young men were expected to adopt in the particular resorts they visited (this was borne out by the sex surveys), whilst expatriate Britons felt that employing at least one live-in domestic worker was something almost required of a person of their status living in Hong Kong or Bangkok. Furthermore, expatriate interviewees offered much poorer working conditions to domestic workers than did their counterparts in London, and justified imposing what one of them even described as 'slavery-like' conditions on grounds that local employers did likewise, and there were no laws to prevent them doing so. More generally, our data supported Bauer's (2001) argument that practices of consumption are crucially affected by four factors - relative price and supply and demand; the relationship between consumption and identity; the social and public significance, and ritualistic character, of consumption; and the importance of postcolonial power in the practice of consumption. The latter was particularly evident in our data on the specific demand for *migrant* domestic workers.

### ***Social Images of Migrants and Demand***

Though respondents in the domestic work survey reported that availability was an important factor in explaining why they employed a migrant worker, they also stated that by offering migrants employment in their homes, they were providing them with the opportunity to 'better themselves'. This was more explicitly articulated by interviewees, who often described migrants as coming from backward, poverty-

stricken, countries, and held that domestic work in Spain or the UK allowed them to learn more 'civilised' practices, such as how to eat with a knife and fork.

The fact it was possible to frame employment as a means of 'helping' poor, uneducated and culturally disadvantaged women was important to our employer interviewees. The discourse of difference they constructed allowed them to manage an otherwise difficult and potentially conflict-ridden relationship with their foreign domestic workers. Domestic workers in private households bring together two very different symbolic domains – home and market – and employers find it hard to maintain the distance implied by an 'employment relation' when this relationship takes place within their own home (the repository of sentiment and moral values). Our interviewees were very explicit about the fact that racial and/or cultural difference made it easier to manage this tension ("They're foreign and they're illegal and... they're going to be very, very small, and that is generally easier to live with than someone who feels that this is their home"). This, in conjunction with employees' immigration status, made the household into a site of exclusion from citizenship, labour and human rights (Bott, 2005, Stock, 2004, Anderson 2004). However, a domestic worker's status as 'foreign' or racially Other was not enough, in itself, to make her a desirable employee, for Otherness is not socially imagined as a homogenous category. Instead, our employer interviewees had explicit preferences for particular groups of migrant workers, and drew on socially endorsed or tolerated racisms to explain and justify these preferences.

Taken together, data on employers shows that there are reasons why they actively seek to employ migrant domestic workers. Immigration status (whether the worker is legal or illegal) is recognised by employers as giving them greater control over aspects of the employment relation that matter to them, in particular, labour retention. Since they are largely working in the informal sector, domestic workers are theoretically free to leave at any time, and quitting is one of the only means they have of limiting employers' powers over them. For the employer, particularly those looking for paid carers, this freedom is problematic. Some immigration statuses give an employer direct control over a worker's visa renewal, thereby making them easier to retain. Even if the migrant's status is dependent on them working in the particular sector rather than for a particular employer, this is recognised as an advantage. Workers do not have to be tied to their employer to give employers confidence regarding retention. Those who are working illegally are recognised as having fewer options, again giving employers both a reason for hiring migrants, and a way of telling themselves that by offering employment, they are doing the migrant a favour: "Especially with the illegal, they're so desperate for work, they're not looking to get fired, they're looking to keep their job... believe me, especially if they're migrant workers, they're so frightened of getting kicked out that they're not going to pull any stunts."

Interviews with third parties who organise and profit from prostitution similarly suggested that while availability is an important factor in the employment of migrant workers, the vulnerability created by certain immigration statuses makes migrants attractive to some sex sector employers because it gives them greater control over labour retention. Some sex sector employers also observed that migrants made better and more reliable workers because they need the money more than nationals. Data on *clients* of migrant sex workers presents a rather different picture. Interviewees in Spain and the UK often stated that migrants were the only workers present in the setting where they had bought sex, and that this, rather than any specific preference for migrant women (or men), explained their experience with migrants. In London the lack of choice was borne out by the telephone survey of 148 indoor prostitution establishments, which found that 80% of workers were described as 'foreign', and only 20% as British. A similar picture emerged from analysis of

advertisements for sex workers in Barcelona in the *Vanguardia* newspaper. At the same time however, the survey data suggest that migrants are generally perceived as being more flexible, willing and cheaper than local sex workers. But this did not necessarily make migrants more attractive to clients.

Research with male and female sex tourists in developing countries shows that they, like our employers of domestic workers, value the economic, social and political inequalities that separate them from the sex worker because this allows them to construct the economic exchange as a 'favour' - they do not feel they are paying for sex, just 'helping' the poor local person out (O'Connell Davidson, 1998; Sanchez Taylor, 2001). By contrast, British tourists and expatriates in Tenerife expressed a strong preference for British sex workers who had migrated to work there, and Spanish and British client interviewees tended to value racial, linguistic, cultural and national-sameness in sex workers (this was also the case in Denmark and Thailand in the pilot study). Some interviewees presented this preference as a form of 'ethical' practice, for instance: "I do tend to try and find British women because they know what it's about, I don't have that zone of discomfort that I may be contributing to someone's exploitation".

The pilot and the follow on research showed that clients typically ranked sex workers according to the social relations that surround their prostitution, such that migrants who were perceived as having been forced into prostitution (either by a third party or by their 'miserable social background') were deemed by most to be less attractive than local women and non-stigmatized groups of migrants (i.e., those from Western Europe, Australia, North America, and also interestingly, Brazil) who were imagined as having entered sex work voluntarily and as enjoying better working conditions.

### ***Attitudes toward Age and Childhood***

Children are defined in the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child as persons below the age of 18, and over the past decade, extensive efforts have been made at international level to raise global awareness of commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) and child labour as problems and to encourage states to adopt measures to combat these problems. In both Spain and the UK, different and particular legal penalties apply to prostitution involving children, but there is no legislation that specifically outlaws child domestic work in either country. Indeed, devising such legislation would be difficult given that domestic work itself is not subject to the same regulatory framework as other forms of labour. In the absence of clearly specified and routinely enforced regulations, employers of domestic workers fall back on broader social ideas and norms in relation to childhood to guide their practices. However, the figure of the child in the social and cultural imagination is unstable and highly malleable.

On the one hand, employers talked about children as the ideal domestic worker (and indeed, tended to construct their adult female workers as children by referring to them as 'girls' and describing them as 'child-like') – trainable, obedient, flexible because they do not have responsibilities to their own families, and as one interviewee put it, "You don't have to pay them". But on the other hand, the child was imagined as immature, troublesome, and implying too great a burden of responsibility for the employer. Teenagers in particular carried an added threat in the form of their assumed rampant sexuality. Nearly half of respondents in the UK would consider employing under-18s for light tasks on a casual basis; one Spanish interviewee had in the past employed a 15 year old as a live-in worker. But in the main, interviewees were clear that they would not employ a child as a live-in domestic worker in the UK or Spain. This connects to questions of availability– employing a child is not a choice that is open to employers in Europe – yet as employers themselves recognised, it

also connects to social norms. Interviewees often stated that they would employ a child domestic worker if they lived in countries where this was common practice.

So far as clients are concerned, interviewees in the UK and Spain generally attached sexual value to youth, but they also wanted the sex workers they used to be old enough to voluntarily and legally enter the prostitution contract. A veneer of consent was vitally important to our interviewees, and though a few felt that girls were able to consent at the age of 16, most stated that the emotional and psychological demands of prostitution are such that only adults can consent to it. Client interviewees were certainly cognizant of recent national and international debates on CSEC in a way that our domestic worker employer interviewees were not aware of debates around the worst forms of child labour. Unsurprisingly, then, in the sex surveys, only a handful of men stated that they preferred sex workers aged under 18, while almost half of British and 46% of Spanish tourist respondents who had paid for sex preferred sex workers aged between 19 and 25.

The research generated other data relevant to the literature on childhood, child migration, and the exploitation of children, some of which has already been analysed and written up, the rest of which we intend to develop for publication.

### ***Differences between European countries***

The significance of social norms and of the social and cultural imagination for consumer demand for the services of migrant sex and domestic workers, and for clients/employers' practices, meant that there were some noticeable differences between our different European research sites. In particular:

- Employer and client interviewees talked about race and ethnicity in different ways in the UK and Spain (also in Sweden and Italy in the pilot study).
- In relation to both domestic work and sex work, Spanish interviewees tended to use the language of contract, the market and employment to describe relations between employers/clients and workers, more than did British interviewees. This meant that they were more likely to imagine workers as entitled to certain rights and protections (for example, in the employer survey, only 27% of UK employers but 80% of Spanish employers stated that domestic workers ought to be entitled to a pension).

### ***Demand for Embodied Labour***

The research findings draw attention to the limitations of conventional labour market analysis in relation to the demand for 'embodied labour'. Client interviewees were not seeking the most efficient means of satisfying their wants – the physical embodiment of the worker who supplies the service mattered to them (though perhaps not always as much as might be expected). Likewise, employers of migrant domestic workers were not motivated simply to hire the most efficient or even the cheapest available worker. They did not merely wish to consume labour/services, but to consume labour/services provided by a particular person, and this had to be a person they could both feel comfortable about bringing into the home and commanding as a worker. Moreover, the person they chose had to affirm rather than undermine the employer's social identity and moral persona. In data from the pilot and the follow on research, sexuality also emerges as an important feature of embodiment and a matter of concern for employers of domestic workers. In the survey, 29% stated that 'attractive' was one of the qualities they least wanted to find in a domestic worker, and fear of the worker's sexuality (as well as possible slippage between domestic work and prostitution) was a theme in many interviews. One employer even stated that she had felt it necessary to replace her migrant worker's clothes before allowing her out with the children as "she looked like a prostitute".

### ***Trafficking***

Debates and proposals on trafficking at policy and advocacy levels in the UK and Spain, also internationally, have focused heavily on prostitution. Domestic work is sometimes mentioned, but little serious attention has been given to forced migration and forced labour in this sector. Yet the finding that some employers of domestic workers actively seek migrants because this enables them to exercise greater control over them as workers suggests that there is reason for concern about the relationship between demand and a market for vulnerable and/or unfree labour. Because the data allow us to explore similarities and differences between these two sectors, it highlights weaknesses and omissions in dominant academic and policy analyses of trafficking. In particular, it draws attention to the critical role played by the state in constructing demand for unprotected labour and also in making some groups of workers vulnerable. The data also show there is no demand for ‘trafficked’ labour as such, and that the distinctions between ‘trafficking’, ‘smuggling’ and other forms of irregular migration that tend to preoccupy state actors are therefore of little relevance from a human and labour rights perspective. Whether migrants have been ‘trafficked’ or ‘smuggled’ or are otherwise illegally present in the country, unscrupulous employers in all sectors are in a position to take advantage of the fact “they’re so frightened... that they’re not going to pull any stunts.”

### ***The Political Construction of Demand***

In addition to social and cultural factors, demand for private household workers is powerfully shaped by policy developments. In the UK, for instance, there has been an expansion in forms of care delivery called ‘cash payments for care’. This is part of a more general shift ‘from mutuality and towards contract in entitlement and delivery’ as regards welfare rights (Morris, 2006: 92), and such arrangements can now be found, in different forms, in several European states including Spain. This policy shift has fostered the development of a thriving informal market for care and domestic workers. Meanwhile, the absence of a clear and enforced regulatory framework leads to an individualisation of the employment relation between domestic workers and employers. Our interview data suggest this is especially the case in the UK where regulation is noticeably weaker. Interviewees saw the (usually implicit) contract between employer and worker as a private matter, one that could be arranged to ‘suit’ both parties, rather than one that was constrained by state oversight.

The state is clearly not directly implicated in commodifying sexual services in the same way that it is implicated in constructing markets for domestic and care work. However, the fact that prostitution is not recognised as an employment sector in the UK and Spain means that third party organisers of prostitution, as well as consumers of sexual services, are free to construct the sale of sex as something other than ‘work’. As our data show, those who own and run brothels do not usually acknowledge that they enter into an employment relation with sex workers, but rather construct the relationship as a mutually convenient arrangement between entrepreneurs. The prostitute is said to rent facilities from the third party, and then trade sex on a self-employed basis, even though the third party normally exercises much control over work rate, working practices, prices, etc. Similarly, the exchange between worker and client is in many respects treated as a private and individual matter – the client may, for example, offer to pay more for risky services, such as unprotected sex, and it is up to the worker to consent or refuse.

In both sectors, the invisibility of the state effectively unleashes a radically free ‘free market’, and if ‘sellers’ and ‘buyers’ were to meet on anything like a level playing field, this radical freedom would not necessarily benefit the buyers. However, other actions taken by the state help to create categories of ‘sellers’ who are vastly unequal in relation to ‘buyers’. Indeed, certain immigration statuses create



marginalized groups without access to the formal labour market, or any of the protections usually offered by states to citizens and workers, so making migrants, especially undocumented migrants, especially attractive to employers (Ungerson, 2003: 382). In fact, so little did our employer/third party interviewees view the relationship with their domestic or sex workers as governed by employment law that they expressed no anxiety about their own vulnerability to criminal prosecution as employers of people working illegally, despite the fact that in theory most were liable to 'employer sanctions'. Their lack of concern was well founded, given that employers in private households and in the sex sector have not been prosecuted under these laws. In all these ways, the state contributes towards a supply of labour and equips employers with labour control and retention mechanisms that would not otherwise be available to them. The same combination of state action and inaction equips those clients who want sex workers to agree to risky practices with the power to secure 'consent'.

### **Activities**

Academic and policy events where we have presented papers are listed in Appendix 3. We have also participated in a wide range of other policy orientated activities relating to the research, at national and international level, including:

2003 'UK-Spain Looking to the future: Immigration', British Council conference, Salamanca, November 23

2003 European Commission: Seminar on informal/undeclared work its changing nature and policy strategies 21<sup>st</sup> May

2004 Dinner with Secretary of State DTI to discuss policies on women and migration, Lancaster House, 1<sup>st</sup> March.

2004 Transport and General Workers Union: Women and Globalisation, Eastbourne 28 July

2004 European Parliament: colloquy on "Domestic slavery: servitude, au pairs and mail order brides" Paris 11-12 March

2005 Launch of ILO Global Alliance Against Forced Labour, MIT, Boston. 14 May.

2006 Contributed to the Home Office Trafficking Consultation

We also organised a user group meeting in 2003, and produced a user group database. Users were kept updated with the project originally through the database, and later using COMPAS tools including: project briefing sheets, website and email updates.

### **Outputs**

Some key outputs have been mentioned above and a full list of publications arising from the research is provided in Appendix 3.

### **Impacts**

A report on the research published by the International Organisation for Migration in 2003 was widely publicised, and a summary of its contents appeared on US Embassy websites around the world. This report was also extensively cited in the 2006 UN Special Rapporteur on the human rights aspects of the victims of trafficking in persons, especially women and children's Report on the Integration of the Human Rights of Women and a Gender Perspective, as well as in responses to her Report. It has also already been referred to in 15 published scholarly works.

We are frequently consulted by user groups including journalists, NGOs and trades unions on matters to do with migration and sex and domestic work.

### **Future Research Priorities**

During interviews with immigration and police officers to collect background information to contextualise research data, we observed that confusion over how to define 'trafficking', and how to distinguish it from other related phenomena (e.g., people smuggling and other forms of illegal immigration) represents a serious problem in relation to existing systems for identification and referral for assistance of trafficked persons and others subject to forced labour in a range of sectors. It was evident that policies designed to control illegal immigration could conflict with those designed to protect the human rights of migrant adults and children, and believe there is an urgent need for research exploring how these tensions and definitional problems play out in encounters between migrants who have experienced abuse and exploitation and the actors charged with implementing government policy on immigration and/or human rights. By the same token, there is a need for research that will help to better define, map and theorise 'forced labour'.

The research also drew our attention to the limitations of existing research and policy on children and migration, which tends to disregard the multiplicity of factors that can leave child migrants vulnerable to a variety of different forms of abuse and exploitation in a variety of different settings, and focus instead on 'sex trafficking'.

### **Ethics**

We have adhered throughout to BSA guidelines on ethical practice. However, the interview research with clients also drew attention to a limitation of these guidelines in relation to informed consent, for even when fully informed about the nature and purpose of the research, interviewees were not always able to foresee the emotional impact of participating in the research. In three cases, it transpired that interviewees' first experience of paid sex was linked to extremely traumatic experiences, and as the interview continued, they began to make more links between their practices as consumers of commercial sex and trauma. As they had not made these connections before, or previously discussed their experiences, the interview was emotionally difficult for them in ways they could not have predicted when they consented to the interview. We responded in the way that is recommended when working with other vulnerable populations, i.e., by offering to end the interview, spending time 'debriefing' after the interview, and referring them to appropriate support services.

## APPENDIX 1.

**Composition and size of data set from each country**

	Thailand	India	Sweden	DK	Italy	Japan	Spain	UK	Total
Sex workers' clients interviews	8	10	0	10	9	0	12	14	63
Client control interviews	2	5	2	3	5	0	5	6	28
Sex sector third party beneficiary interviews	2	3	0	3	1	0	4	7	20
Domestic worker employer interviews	6	8	10	0	10	0	11	11	56
Expatriate domestic worker employer interviews	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	8	8
Employer control interviews	2	3	4	0	5	0	0	0	14
Domestic work third party beneficiary interviews	1	3	5	0	1	0	5	5	20
Commercial sex survey with various groups	90	62	84	0	56	98	134	274	798
Domestic worker employer survey	51	66	31	0	45	0	46	50	289

The data set from the pilot and follow on research shown above differs from that originally planned in the following respects. First, though we had built control interviews into the design of both the pilot study and the follow up research, the selection of control interviewees proved problematic. Social norms regarding

commercial sex and domestic work differed so much between countries that in the pilot study, researchers in some countries were unable to find 10 interviewees *without* experience of buying sex or employing domestic workers. In the follow-on research in the UK and Spain, we experienced similar problems with the control sample for employers of domestic workers. Following sampling techniques successfully used by Cox (1998), we recruited employers for interview by selecting a number of streets in London and Barcelona, and approaching each household to ask whether they were willing to participate in the research. However, since virtually everyone living in the areas we selected employed a domestic worker (either live-in or live-out), we could not recruit a genuinely matching control sample using the same sampling method.

Second, our Swedish research team found it impossible to recruit ten male Swedish interviewees with experience of buying sex from migrant workers, and therefore decided to conduct client interviews in Denmark, where the consumption of commercial sex is more common and less stigmatised. The Swedish researchers also experienced difficulties accessing a sample of people who employed live-in domestic workers. Third, midway through the pilot research, the Swedish Ministry of Foreign Affairs requested that the commercial sex survey should be conducted in Japan, in addition to the other countries. Taken together, these problems and changes mean that the pilot study did not achieve an entirely standard set of quantitative and qualitative data on the demand for migrant sex workers and domestic workers in four countries, as initially planned. This largely reflected the fact that adequate time and resources had not been allowed for the design, planning, preparation and co-ordination of a multi-country study on an extremely sensitive topic (see Anderson and O'Connell Davidson, 2002).

In addition to the above data set, we conducted a telephone survey of 148 indoor prostitution establishments in London, asking receptionists to state the nationality of workers therein, the services on offer, and the prices for these services.

### **Data from Tenerife**

Data in Tenerife was gathered during four fieldtrips. The research incorporated multiple methods and data sources, a research strategy intended not only to produce the richest possible ethnographic understanding of the topic under investigation, but also to allow the validity of data to be checked through triangulation. We explored questions about the demand for migrant sex workers through lengthy in-depth interviews and briefer interviews with a non-random sample of 50 sex workers, managers of lapdance clubs and brothels, tourists, and migrant Britons living and/or working in Tenerife; and examined the demand for migrant domestic workers through formal and informal interviews with hotel managers, employees of accommodation rental agencies, locals and expatriates. In addition to the commercial sex survey which was completed by 64 Spanish tourists and 179 British tourists, a survey of 100 British people working in the tourist industry in Tenerife was conducted which included questions on their experience of visiting lapdance clubs and of paying for commercial sexual services.

## APPENDIX 2

### References

- Anderson, B. (2004) 'Employers' use of "foreignness", race and ethnicity in negotiating relations with migrant domestic workers', paper presented at University of Edinburgh ESRC seminar series Non-familial relations across the life course, 13 September
- Anderson, B. and O'Connell Davidson, J., (2002) *The Demand-Side of Trafficking*. Two part report, Stockholm: Save the Children Sweden.
- Anderson, B. and O'Connell Davidson, J., (2003) *Is Trafficking in Human Beings Demand Driven? A multi-country pilot study*. IOM Migration Research Series, No. 15, Geneva: IOM.
- Anderson, B. and O'Connell Davidson, J., (2005) 'Border troubles and invisibility: Child rights and migration in Europe', paper presented to the Save the Children, Sweden Seminar on Children and Rightless Migration, Stockholm, June 1.
- Bauer, A. (2001) *Goods, Power, History: Latin America's material culture*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Bott, E. (2005) 'Too close for comfort? 'Race' and the management of proximity, guilt and other anxieties in paid domestic labour', *Sociological Research Online*, Vol. 10, 3. <http://www.socresonline.org.uk/10/3/bott.html>
- Castles, S. and, M (1998) *The Age of Migration: International Migration Movements in the Modern World*. London: Macmillan
- Cox, R.(1998) *Race, Class, Gender and Paid Domestic Work in London*. PhD Thesis. Coventry University.
- Einhorn, B., (2004) *Cinderella Goes to Market: Citizenship, gender and women's movements in East Central Europe*. London: Verso.
- Morris, L., (ed) (2006) *Rights: Sociological perspectives*. London: Routledge.
- Nichols, T., (ed) (1980) *Capital and Labour*. London: Fontana.
- O'Connell Davidson, J., (2005) *Children in the Global Sex Trade*. Cambridge: Polity.
- O'Connell Davidson, J., (1998) *Prostitution, Power and Freedom*. Cambridge: Polity.
- Sanchez Taylor, J. (2001) 'Dollars are a girl's best friend? Female tourists' sexual behaviour in the Caribbean', *Sociology*, Vol. 35, No. 3, pp 749 – 64.
- Schuster, (2003) 'An Open Debate on Open Borders: a reply to Stephen Castles' *Open Democracy*, December 2003
- Stock, I., (2004) 'Concepts of ethnicity, race and culture in employers' relations with their domestic workers and their implications for citizenship', paper presented to 4<sup>th</sup> Congreso sobre la inmigracion en espana: ciudadania y participacion, Girona, Spain, 10-13 November.
- Ungerson, C. (2003) 'Commodified care work in European labour markets' *European Societies* Vol. 5, No. 4 377-96
- Wolkowitz, C. (2002) 'The Social Relations of Body Work', *Work, Employment & Society*, Vol. 16, No. 3, September.
- Yuval Davis, N. (1997) *Gender and Nation*. London: Sage.

## APPENDIX 3

### List of outputs arising from or informed by the project

#### 1. Journal Articles

Anderson, B. (2006 – forthcoming) 'A very private business: migration and domestic work' *European Journal of Women's Studies*.

Bott, E., (2004) 'Working on a working-class utopia: Marking young Britons in Tenerife on the new map of European migration', *Journal for Contemporary European Studies*, Vol. 12, No. 1, pp.57-70.

Bott, E. (2005) 'Too close for comfort? 'Race' and the management of proximity, guilt and other anxieties in paid domestic labour', *Sociological Research Online*, Vol. 10, 3. <http://www.socresonline.org.uk/10/3/bott.html>

Bott, E., (2006) 'Pole position: migrant British women producing 'selves' through lap dancing work', *Feminist Review*, No. 83, pp 23 –41.

O'Connell Davidson, J. (2006) 'Will the Real Sex Slave Please Stand Up?', *Feminist Review*, No. 83, pp 4-22.

O'Connell Davidson, J. (2006) "'Manner, mittler, migranten: marktgesetze des 'menschenhandels'", *Osteuropa*, Vol 56, No 6, pp 7-20. Reprinted as 'Men, middlemen and migrants: the demand side of sex trafficking', *Eurozine*, <http://www.eurozine.com/articles/2006-07-27-davidson-en.html>

O'Connell Davidson, J. (2003) 'Sleeping with the enemy? Some problems with feminist abolitionist calls to penalise those who buy commercial sex', *Social Policy & Society*, Vol 2, No 1, pp55-63.

#### 2. Books

Anderson, B., (2006) *Migrantinnen in der bezahlten Hausarbeit in Europa*. Berlin: Assoziation A.

O'Connell Davidson, J., (2005) *Children in the Global Sex Trade*. Cambridge: Polity.

#### 3. Book Chapters

Anderson, B. (2003) 'A job like any other?' in B. Ehrenreich and A. Hochschild (eds) *Global Woman: Nannies, Maids and Sex Workers in the New Economy*. New York: Metropolitan Books.

Anderson, B. (2004) 'Who needs Yehudi Menuhin? Costs and Impacts of migration', in D. Aguilar and A. Lacsamana (eds) *Women and Globalisation* New York: Humanity Books.

Anderson, B (2004) 'Sono straniere, clandestine e molto, molto modeste' in S. Mezzadra (ed) *I confine della liberta: per un'analisi politica delle migrazioni contemporanee* Milan: Derive Approdi.

Anderson, B. (2004) 'Migrant domestic Workers and Slavery' in C. Van den Anker (ed) *The Political Economy of New Slavery*.

Anderson, B. and O'Connell Davidson, J. (2006) 'The trouble with trafficking', in C. Van den Anker and J. Doomernik (eds) *Trafficking and Women's Rights*. London: Palgrave. (in press)

#### **4. Reports/Working papers**

Anderson, B. and O'Connell Davidson, J., (2002) *The Demand-Side of Trafficking*. Two part report, Stockholm: Save the Children Sweden.

Anderson, B. and O'Connell Davidson, J., (2003) *Is Trafficking in Human Beings Demand Driven? A multi-country pilot study*. IOM Migration Research Series, No. 15, Geneva: IOM.

Anderson, B. (2006) *Migration and Domestic Work*. COMPAS Working Paper Series, WP-06-28

#### **5. Conference and Seminar Papers**

Anderson, B. (2006) 'When is a worker not a worker?' presentation to conference Regularisation is not the Only Way, Platform for Co-operation on Undocumented Migrants, Brussels, 15 March

Anderson, B. (2005) 'Labour markets, exploitation and organising of migrant workers in the UK', presentation at CRE/TUC Conference, Fighting Exploitation of Migrant Workers, London, 5 December

Anderson, B. (2005) 'Migrant Children in the UK' presentation to Save the Children Seminar, London 27 October

Anderson, B. (2005) 'Migration and forced labour: the key role of the sub-contractor', paper presented to Public Service International Forum on Gender Equality, conference on Trafficking, Geneva 26-27 September

Anderson, B. (2005) 'Ethical climate and global warming', paper presented at University of Nottingham, ESRC seminar series, The Market and its Discontents, 22 June

Anderson, B. (2005) 'Illegality and Domestic Work', paper presented to conference on Illegality and Domestic work, NIAS, Wassenaar, 22 May

Anderson, B. (2005) 'Trafficking: New Directions', paper presented to OSCE seminar on Trafficking, Warsaw, 19-20 May

Anderson, B. (2005) 'Domestic Work and Irregular Migration', paper presented to European Trades Union Congress, 'Out of the Shadows: Migration and Domestic Work', Brussels 14-15 April.

Anderson, B. (2004) 'Employers' use of "foreignness", race and ethnicity in negotiating relations with migrant domestic workers', paper presented at University of Edinburgh ESRC seminar series Non-familial relations across the life course, 13 September

Anderson, B. (2004) "'They're foreign, illegal and very, very small" Migration and employment in private households in the UK' paper presented to conference on Asian domestic workers, national University of Singapore April.

Anderson, B. (2004) 'Markets and Migrants' University of Sussex seminar series 14 January

Anderson, B. (2003) 'Migration Policies and Vulnerabilities of Domestic Workers', paper presented to ILO Conference on Protection of Domestic Workers against the Threat of Forced Labour and Trafficking, Hong Kong 16-19 February.

Anderson, B. (2003) 'Forced labour, beyond good and evil' ILO/TUC seminar on forced labour. London 1 December

Anderson, B. (2003) 'Response to paper on domestic work and the underground economy' presented to DG Research and DG Employment and Social Affairs,

- European Commission, Seminar on informal/undeclared work: Research on its changing nature and policy strategies in an enlarged Europe, Brussels, March 10
- Anderson, B. (2003) 'Migration: the dragon's soft underbelly', paper for World Social Forum, Porto Alegre January
- Anderson, B. (2003) 'Family life: making migrant workers visible', paper for World Social Forum, Porto Alegre January
- Anderson, B. (2002) 'Response to paper on enabling and empowering mobile women and girls' paper presented to the UNIFEM and Swedish Ministry of Foreign Affairs Seminar on Promoting Gender Equality to Combat Trafficking in Women and Children, Bangkok, Thailand, 7-9 October.
- Anderson, B. (2002) 'The Need for a Labour Perspective on Trafficking Issues', paper for Asian-Europe People's Forum, Copenhagen 19-22 September
- Anderson, B. and Cox, R. (2002) 'Emotions and the Commodification of Female Labour inside the Home' paper for conference on Emotional Geographies, Lancaster 23 September
- Anderson, B. and O'Connell Davidson, J., (2005) 'Border troubles and invisibility: Child rights and migration in Europe', paper presented to the Save the Children, Sweden Seminar on Children and Rightless Migration, Stockholm, June 1.
- Bott, E., (2004) 'Sink or swim: Why young Britons migrate to Tenerife', paper presented to the International Sociological Association Conference on Social Stratification and Mobility, Neuchatel, Switzerland, May 6-9.
- Bott, E., (2004) 'Sex and drugs and selling souls: Identity and work in the timeshare industry of Tenerife', paper presented to the International Labour Process Conference, Amsterdam, April 5-7.
- Bott, E., (2003) 'Too close for comfort? 'Race' and the management of proximity, guilt and other anxieties in paid domestic labour', paper presented to the British Sociological Association Conference, York, April 11-13.
- O'Connell Davidson, J. and Farrow, C. (2006) 'Sex slavery, sex work and labour standards in the UK', paper presented to the Sex Work Matters: Beyond Divides Conference, CUNY, New York, USA March 30.
- O'Connell Davidson, J. (2006) 'The demand side of trafficking? Problems and issues', paper presented to the Trafficking in Human Beings on the Political Agenda Conference, Museum of World Culture, Goteborg, Sweden, September 11.
- O'Connell Davidson, J. (2005) "Will the real victim please stand up?" paper presented to Capita Learning & Development Conference on Tackling the Trafficking of Women and Children, London, February 9.
- O'Connell Davidson, J. (2003) 'Childhood and sex tourism: rhetoric and realities' paper presented to the World Tourism Organization and Brazilian Ministry of Tourism World Forum on Sustainable Tourism, 'Turismo Sustentavel & Infancia', Salvador, Brazil, 2-4 December.
- O'Connell Davidson, J. (2003) "Complexities of the demand side of CSEC", paper presented to the Foro de ONGs de Iberoamerica en el marco de la VI reunion ministerial, San Jose, Costa Rica, 16 and 17 October.
- O'Connell Davidson, J. (2003) "The demand side of trafficking: problems and issues", paper presented to the OSCE Conference on Human Trafficking, Ioannina, Greece, 16-18 February.



O'Connell Davidson, J. (2003) "The trouble with trafficking", paper presented to the Launch Workshop of the Network for European Women's Rights, Centre for the Study of Global Ethics, University of Birmingham, January 29.

O'Connell Davidson, J. (2002) 'Response to paper on changing social attitudes towards sexuality' paper presented to the UNIFEM and Swedish Ministry of Foreign Affairs Seminar on Promoting Gender Equality to Combat Trafficking in Women and Children, Bangkok, Thailand, 7-9 October.

O'Connell Davidson, J. (2002) 'Trafficking and modern slavery', paper presented to the 5000 Years of Slavery conference, University of Nottingham, 12-14 September.

Stock, I., (2004) 'Concepts of ethnicity, race and culture in employers' relations with their domestic workers and their implications for citizenship', paper presented to 4<sup>th</sup> Congreso sobre la inmigracion en espana: ciudadania y participacion, Girona, Spain, 10-13 November.